Evaluation of Elementary School Heavenly Gifts Books According to the Components of Moral Intelligence from Borba's Perspective

Jaber Eftekhari[1]✉ iD | Hojjat. Eftekhari[2] iD |

1. Corresponding author, Ph.D. Student in Philosophy of Education, Department of Education, Faculty of Education and Psychology, University of Isfahan, Isfahan, Iran. E-mail: jaber.eftekhari@gmail.com
2. Ph.D. of Curriculum, Department of Educational Sciences, Faculty of Humanities, University of Hormozgan, Bandar Abbas, Iran. E-mail: hojjat.eftekhari18@gmail.com

Article Info	ABSTRACT
	Objective: Moral Intelligence encompasses the capacity to discern between what is morally right and wrong, possess firm moral convictions, and actively apply these principles in one's actions. It is imperative to recognize that moral values are not hereditary, but rather acquired through learning. Consequently, the aim of this investigation is to assess the Elementary School Heavenly Gifts books in light of Borba's perspective on the various facets of Moral Intelligence. **Methods**: The approach employed in this descriptive study is content analysis, which involves scrutinizing the information contained within five volumes of Elementary school textbooks from the academic year 2020-2021, employing a content analysis checklist tool in accordance with the Components of Moral Intelligence. Subsequently, the desired Components were identified as criteria for analysis, and the content of the book was examined utilizing William Rumi's technique. **Results**: The findings indicate that the level of attention devoted to the Components of Moral Intelligence in the content of the Elementary School Heavenly Gifts books is moderately effective, necessitating the need for editorial revisions to enhance the focus on Moral Intelligence and its various Components. Notably, the third Grade Heavenly Gifts book demonstrates the lowest level of involvement (ISE = 0.67), while the sixth heaven Heavenly Gifts book exhibits the highest level of involvement (ISE = 0.83). Additionally, the results of the Chi-square test (Sig: 0.001, Chi-Square: 21.636) demonstrate a significant difference between the Components of Moral Intelligence at a 0.001 level of significance. **Conclusions**: According to the results there is a significant difference between two interventions Therefore, the Component of Kindness holds the highest frequency at 8.50%, whereas the Component of Fairness possesses the lowest frequency at 4.78% among the Components of Moral Intelligence.

Introduction

Moral education, on one hand, pertains to the placement of ethics within the societal framework and the role ethics plays in the well-being of individuals and society. On the other hand, it is associated with the intricate interconnection between ethics and education. The significance of moral education can be understood by acknowledging the Holy Prophet's (PBUH) proclamation of his prophetic mission to foster moral virtues. Furthermore, ancient philosophers like Socrates, Plato, and Aristotle, in addition to divine religions, have emphasized that the primary objective of education is to cultivate individuals who possess moral qualities such as knowledge, justice, and self-control (Pakseresht, 2001, 25 and 26). Among contemporary philosophers, Spinoza and Rousseau have praised Morality as the supreme aspect of man. Kant also considers human dignity as dependent on his Morality and while emphasizing the sanctity of Moral law, considers Moral education as the last and highest level of education (Shokouhi, 1995, 72).

In recent years, Moral education has undergone major changes and with the increase of Moral problems in the present century, an increasing tendency towards Moral education and Moral values has been formed in educational settings (GolMohammadian et al., 2012). In this regard, Moral Intelligence was first introduced into psychology by Borba (Borba, 2011, 23), which gives our mental capacity to decide how universal human principles should be based on values, goals, and actions. To be employed, he points out (Lennick & Kiel, 2008: 7)., in today's modern global environment, this Intelligence can act as a kind of orientation for actions and guide other types of human Intelligence to do valuable work (Bahrami et al., 2012). It should also be noted that the ethical decision-making process is not conditioned by demographic factors such as gender, race, or nationality (Ford and Richardson, 1994). It is an acquired and learnable skill that can be taught through interaction between the environment and the individual. According to experts, the best time to teach this skill is from birth to adolescence, when parents can teach their children Moral qualities such as self-control, patience, Fairness, empathy, forgiveness, and other appropriate qualities. Cultivate Morally (Lennick & Kiel, 2007).

Therefore, children who for any reason have not been able to develop their Moral Intelligence are at serious risk due to a shaky conscience, weakness in controlling desires and impulses, immature Moral sensitivities, and beliefs that are incorrect. Guided, may turn them into abnormal and unsuccessful characters in the future. Also, due to the complexity and deviation of social and Moral

values in today's society and as a result of creating behavioral and social problems in children, teaching the concepts of Moral Intelligence may be able to help children improve behavioral and social performance (Rezapour Mirsaleh et al., 2017). In this regard, education has been defined as the most important social institution for the development of children's Moral Intelligence, and education experts believe that ethics education should start in schools and teach global Moral values as part of their educational program. Consider (Tom, 1984) Because every society needs a principled plan and a logical answer to continue its life and explain what is meaningful in life and what Moral norms people should be in control of (Attaran, 2003, 228). On the other hand, a written educational program in this field has not been presented by the Education Organization (Rezapour Mirsaleh et al., 2017).

With this description, dealing with Moral Intelligence is one of the important issues that has attracted more attention, especially in recent years, and as an effective tool in managing social behaviors has been the focus of world attention and is one of the factors, that determines the level of Moral behavior of individuals and the degree of readiness of individuals to pay the bio-Moral cost (Borba, 2011, 21). Therefore, conducting basic research in the field of Moral education is one of the basic needs of human societies, including our country. Ethical education includes a wide range of questions of principles, principles, goals, content, methods, etc., the answer to which requires many quantitative and qualitative studies, and inevitably to conduct a research activity, one must choose from various subjects of Moral education (Haghighat & Mazidi, 2008). Therefore, creating a positive school culture is essential to achieve the desired results for students' Moral Intelligence, because schools develop Moral Intelligence by determining the views, values, goals, and priorities of the curriculum and promote related learning and teaching methods. In this context, the content approach is very important in developing students' Moral Intelligence, and Moral Intelligence can be considered as a basis for school curricula. Because of the current situation of society and the need to promote the Moral education of individuals and the subsequent development of society, it is necessary to acquaint students with the correct methods of Moral behavior and teach them the necessary skills.

Thinkers have consistently displayed significant interest in comprehending essential Moral attributes in life and the function of educational establishments in enhancing them. This is due to

the fact that Moral values are deeply ingrained in the entirety of individuals' lives and necessitate specific objectives, content, and approaches. The epistemology of education should therefore be formulated in accordance with these values (Hajideh Abadi, 2000). Despite the importance of teaching Moral Intelligence in schools, very few studies have been conducted in this field in our country. For example, the results of Hejazi et al. (2020) showed that the use of Moral Intelligence training is effective in increasing academic ethics and academic self-efficacy in students. Findings The research of Delbari et al. (2016) showed that all Components of Moral Intelligence including honesty, responsibility, forgiveness, compassion, Moral values , and communication skills have a direct impact on social capital and self-awareness. It was meaningful. Also, all Components of Moral Intelligence through the mediation of social capital had an indirect and significant effect on students' self-awareness. The result of Alizadeh's (2018) research indicates that there is a significant and direct relationship between the Components of Moral Intelligence and Emotional Intelligence with the Moral behavior of the staff of the Kermanshah Children and Adolescents Intellectual Development Center. The results of Bakhtiari and Soleimani (2017) showed that strengthening students' Moral beliefs can strengthen macro-policies in the university structure to prevent the spread of fraud. The research conducted by Hassanpour Rudbaraki and Mohammaddavoodi (2016) revealed that a positive and significant correlation exists between Moral Intelligence and its various dimensions, such as fostering a conducive rapport with students, cultivating a supportive environment, and promoting independent research through knowledge dissemination among secondary school educators in Saveh city. Arasteh et al. (2010) found in a study that there is a significant difference between the Components of Moral Intelligence and there is a positive and significant relationship between age, level of education, and Moral Intelligence. Shannon et al. (2016) stated in a study that ethics and ethical characteristics are effective in forming trust in the organization and lead to improved organizational processes and communication. Tanner and Kristen (2014) found in a study that the most important factors affecting Moral Intelligence are the level of participation of individuals in social good deeds, government encouragement and support for professional ethics in organizations, and educating families to get acquainted. Children with this concept are from childhood and people who have strong Moral beliefs and can implement them can behave correctly and wisely and by Moral standards. Narweez (2013) found in a study that teachers with high Moral Intelligence are excellent in classroom

management. These teachers are happy and efficient even in their individual lives and have the power that makes them productive people. Hardy and Carlo (2005) found in their research that Moral reasoning affects Moral motivation and Moral identity is the source of Moral motivation that is related to self-concept, interests, and Moral values. Moral identity also plays an important role in Moral behavior, and people with higher Moral identities have higher levels of Moral behavior. Reviewing the background of the research reveals that, despite previous investigations in the realm of Moral Intelligence and its correlation with the curriculum, education, social performance, and classroom dynamics, no studies were discovered that assess the Heavenly Gift books of that era. A primary school, whose primary objective is the cultivation of Moral skills, is the focus of this examination. With this in mind, the present study has undertaken an evaluation of the Elementary school Gift books, specifically considering the extent to which they address the Components of Moral Intelligence from Borba's perspective. This evaluation aims to address the following inquiries:

1. To what extent does the content of Elementary school Heavenly Gift books engage students with the Components of Moral Intelligence?

2. Is there a significant difference in the distribution of Moral Intelligence Components in Elementary school Gift books?

Conceptual and operational definition of Moral Intelligence

In this section, to clarify the concept of Moral Intelligence, the definitions provided in this field are discussed:

1.   **Conceptual definition**: Moral Intelligence is the capacity and ability to understand right from wrong, to have strong Moral beliefs and to practice them, and also, to behave in the right direction (Borba, 2005).

2.   **Operational definition**: In the present study, the meaning of Moral Intelligence is Borba's model of Moral Intelligence, which has seven Components empathy, conscience, self-control, respect, Kindness, Tolerance, and Fairness. These components are measured. The following are the concepts of these seven Components:

Empathy: Empathy means seeing the world through the eyes of others, the emotional ability to experience the emotions of others, and the cognitive ability to understand other people's emotions

(Hawkins & Troubest, 2000).

Conscience: is a kind of internal factor that controls human thoughts and actions (Mirsapasi, 1998).

Self-control: means that in choosing your behaviors or actions, instead of relying on instantaneous motivations, their results should be considered and then acted upon (Nikogftar, 2007).

Respect: Respect is at the core of Morality, and parents need to build mutual respect in their relationships with their children (Likuna, 1993).

Kindness: Paying attention to the needs and feelings of others, by strengthening this virtue, the child will have less selfishness and become More Compassionate and Sad (Borba, 2005).

Tolerance: Respecting the rights of all people, even those whose beliefs and behaviors are different from ours (Borba, 2005).

Fairness: It is a virtue that makes us treat all people equally and fairly, regardless of race, culture, appearance, gender, and economic status (Borba, 2005).

Materials and Methods

The current investigation employed the approach of referencing documents and employing content analysis techniques to assess the Elementary school Heavenly Gift books in terms of their attention to the Components of Moral Intelligence. In accordance with the research objective, the Heavenly Gift books were regarded as content that could serve as an indicator of the level of attention given to the concept of Moral Intelligence in Elementary school. Thus, the information community for this study consisted of the content of Elementary school Gift books in the academic year 2020-2021. Moreover, within this study, the Heavenly Gift books were selected from the collection of Elementary school textbooks using the purpose-oriented sampling method. Consequently, to examine the content of the aforementioned books, the method put forth by William Rumy (1986) was employed to process the units of analysis and ascertain the extent of students' engagement with these books in relation to the Components of Moral Intelligence, as well as to investigate any significant differences. The chi-square test was utilized to examine the Components of Moral Intelligence in this study. The Components of Moral Intelligence, as defined in this study, are based on Borba's perspective and encompass Empathy, Conscience, Self-control, Respect, Kindness, Tolerance, and Fairness (Borba, 2005).

It is noteworthy that in this study, the level of engagement was obtained by dividing the total frequency of analytical units that demonstrated attention to the Components of Moral Intelligence by the total frequency of analytical units that did not demonstrate attention to Moral Intelligence. According to this approach, the level of engagement was derived by dividing the sum of units pertaining to Moral Intelligence by the sum of units not pertaining to Moral Intelligence. Suppose the level of engagement obtained is 0.5; in that case, it would indicate that 25% of the units of analysis are associated with the Components of Moral Intelligence. If the level of engagement obtained is 1, it would indicate that 50% of the units of analysis are associated with the Components of Moral Intelligence. If the level of engagement exceeds 0.5, it suggests a semi-active and relatively favorable status of the book with regard to the Components of Moral Intelligence, and if it exceeds 1, it suggests an active and favorable status of the book in terms of possessing components of Moral Intelligence (Amir Teymouri et al., 2013; 169). Furthermore, to compute the percentages in the table, the total number of units of analysis was considered as 100%, and the percentage for each component was calculated based on the total number of units of analysis (100%) using the proportionality table.

Results

After conducting an analysis of the units of analysis in the Heavenly Gift books of Elementary school, a comprehensive presentation of the survey findings has been organized into three tables based on the educational level (tables 1,2 and 3).

Question 1: How much attention has been paid to the Components of Moral Intelligence in Elementary school Gift books?

Table 1. Frequency of Moral Intelligence Components in Elementary Heavenly Gift Books

Components	Frequency	Frequency percentage
Empathy	86	6.04
Conscience	73	5.13
Self-control	80	5.62
Respect	99	6.96
Kindness	121	8.50
Tolerance	89	6.25
Fairness	68	4.78
Frequency	616	-
percentage	-	43.31

The results of Table 1 show that in the heavenly Gift books of Elementary school, the Components of Moral Intelligence have been mentioned a total of 616 times, of which the Component of Empathy with 6.04% (86 cases), Conscience with 13.5% (73%). Case), Self-Control 5.62% (80 cases), Respect 6.96% (99 cases), Kindness 8.50% (121 cases), Tolerance 6.25% (89 cases), and Fairness 4.78% (68 cases) have been assigned to frequency. Among these, the Kindness Component with 8.50% frequency has the highest and the Fairness Component with 4.78% frequency has the lowest frequency.

Question 2: Is there a significant difference in the distribution of Moral Intelligence Components in Elementary school Gift books?

Table 2. Examining difference in the distribution of Moral Intelligence Components in Elementary school Gift books

Components	Frequency		Frequency percentage	df	x^2	p
	observed	Expected				
Empathy	86	88	6.04	6	21.63	0.001
Conscience	73	88	5.13			
Self-control	80	88	5.62			
Respect	99	88	6.96			
Kindness	121	88	8.50			
Tolerance	89	88	6.25			
Fairness	68	88	4.78			

Based on the data in Table 2, the null hypothesis is not confirmed and the difference between the Components of Moral Intelligence were confirmed at the level of 0.001 (Chi-Square: 21.63, p < 0.001). In other words, the Components of Respect and Kindness exceeded expectations, the Components of Empathy and Tolerance close to expectations, and the Components of Self-control, Conscience and Fairness less than expected, respectively.

Question 3: To what extent does the content of Elementary school Gift books engage students with the Components of Moral Intelligence?

Table 3. Students' engagement with Moral Intelligence Components in Elementary school Gift books

Grade/Component	Empathy	Conscience	Self-control	Respect	Kindness	Tolerance	Fairness	Related units (F)	Unrelated units (F)	Analysis units (F)	Engagement (ISE)
Second	16	9	13	17	21	13	12	101	134	235	0.75
Percentage	6.80	3.82	5.53	7.23	8.93	5.53	5.10	42.97	57.02	100	-
Third	14	18	9	24	17	11	16	109	162	271	0.67
Percentage	5.16	6.64	3.32	8.85	6.27	4.05	5.90	40.22	59.77	100	-
Fourth	17	14	20	12	24	19	11	117	168	285	0.69
Percentage	5.96	4.91	7.01	4.21	8.42	6.66	3.85	41.05	58.94	100	-
Fifth	23	19	22	18	28	23	12	145	172	314	0.82
Percentage	7.23	6.05	7	5.73	8.91	7.32	3.82	46.17	54.77	100	-
Sixth	16	13	16	28	31	23	17	144	172	317	0.83
Percentage	5.04	4.10	5.04	8.38	9.77	7.25	5.36	45.42	54.55	100	-
Total	86	73	80	99	121	89	68	616	809	1422	0.75
Percentage	6.04	5.13	5.62	6.96	8.50	6.65	4.78	43.31	56.89	100	-

According to the result of determining the involvements of conflict (Second Heaven Gifts: 0.75, Third Heaven Gifts: 0.67, Fourth Heaven Gifts: 0.69, Fifth Heaven Gifts: 0.82, and Gifts Sixth Heaven:: 0.83) Students with the content of each book Heavenly Gifts of the Elementary school in Table 3, we see that engagement rate of all five numerical books is greater than 0.5, which indicates that more than 25% of the analysis units of these books have dealt with the Components of Moral Intelligence. Therefore, each of the Elementary school heavenly Gift books is semi-active and relatively desirable in terms of dealing with Moral Intelligence. In this regard, the Book of Gifts of the Third grade has the lowest engagement, and the Book of Gifts of the Sixth grade has the highest engagement. Also, the student's engagement with all books is 0.75. Therefore, the engagement value is greater than 0.5 and it can be inferred that more than 25% of the analysis units have dealt with Moral Intelligence. Also, 43.31% of the concepts presented in Elementary school

Gift books explain the Components of Moral Intelligence. Therefore, the educational burden of the mentioned books in the field of paying attention to the Components of Moral Intelligence is semi-active and relatively desirable.

Discussion

The objective of this investigation was to assess the Heaven Gift books intended for Elementary school students based on the degree of attention given to the Components of Moral Intelligence from Borba's standpoint. The findings presented in Table 1 demonstrate that among the Components of Moral Intelligence, the Component of Kindness, with a percentage of 8.50, attains the highest frequency, while the Component of Fairness, with a percentage of 4.78, exhibits the lowest frequency. Analyzing the results illustrated in Table 2 reveals a substantial disparity between the Components of Moral Intelligence at a significance level of 0.001. Empathy and Tolerance approximate the anticipated level, whereas the Components of Self-control, Conscience, and Fairness fall below expectations. The outcomes depicted in Table 3 indicate that the engagement rate of all five numerical books exceeds 0.5, signifying that over 25% of the units of analysis within these books address the Components of Moral Intelligence. Consequently, each Elementary school Heaven Gift book demonstrates a moderate level of activity in terms of addressing Moral Intelligence. Specifically, the Third Grade Heavenly Gifts book manifests the lowest degree of engagement, while the sixth Grade Heavenly Gifts book exhibits the highest degree of engagement. Additionally, the involvement of students with all ISE books is 0.75, implying that 43.31% of the concepts presented in the Elementary school Gift books pertain to the Components of Moral Intelligence. Therefore, the educational burden associated with the aforementioned books in terms of attending to the Components of Moral Intelligence is moderately active and relatively satisfactory. Moreover, based on the obtained level of engagement, it can be deduced that the engagement of students with the content of Heavenly Gift books in Elementary school has shown an increasing trend. Among them, the book titled " Heaven Gifts of the Sixth grade" stands out with an engagement rate of 0.83, displaying the highest degree of engagement, while the book titled " Heaven Gifts of the Third grade" exhibits the lowest degree of engagement with a value of 0.67. Hence, the content of the examined books adheres to a specific order in terms of the sequencing and presentation of materials related to Moral Intelligence, with the concepts

associated with Moral Intelligence gaining more prominence as the educational level advances. Thus, the Elementary school Heavenly Gift books have not provided equal consideration to all Components of Moral Intelligence, resulting in some Components receiving more attention than others. It is evident that schools play a significant role in fostering students' Moral Intelligence and can establish a supportive atmosphere for the cultivation of life skills. Given the positive and practical aspects of Moral Intelligence, the centralization of our country's education system, and the current state of society, it is necessary for our educational system to adopt an approach towards understanding Moral concepts and promoting Moral Intelligence. Therefore, the educational system should not merely be subject to change, but rather be effective in guiding and facilitating change. By familiarizing students with Moral Intelligence and its impact on life, the educational system can help shape individuals with strong moral character. To achieve this, it is imperative to develop an educational plan that possesses the necessary capacity and determination to implement a Moral Intelligence program, thereby fulfilling the mentioned conditions and requirements. It is evident that such a system needs to be updated in order to address the evolving demands. Furthermore, it is crucial for textbook planners and authors to exert additional effort. Based on the findings obtained, it is recommended that the authors of textbooks devote more attention to the Component of Fairness in the Heavenly Gifts of Elementary School books. Additionally, the present study reveals that the content of Elementary school Gift books lacks a specific pattern in the field of Moral Intelligence. Therefore, curriculum planners are advised to structure Gift textbooks according to theories of Moral Intelligence, including Borba's model. Moreover, researchers are encouraged to evaluate the content of other textbooks from the perspective of Borba's Moral Intelligence model.

Data availability statement

The original contributions presented in the study are included in the article/supplementary material, further inquiries can be directed to the corresponding author.

Ethics statement

The studies involving human participants were reviewed and approved by ethics committee of University of Hormozgan. The patients/participants provided their written informed consent to participate in this study.

Author contributions

J.E and H.E contributed to the study conception and design, material preparation, data collection and analysis. All authors contributed to the article and approved the submitted version.

Funding

The authors did (not) receive support from any organization for the submitted work.

Conflict of interest

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

References

Alizadeh, Z. (1998) The relationship between Moral Intelligence and Emotional Intelligence with Moral behavior, *Journal of Ethics in Science and Technology*, 13 (2), 174-167.

Amirteimoury, M. H., Zare, M., Sarikhani, R., & Salari, M. (2014). An Investigation on the Conformity Degree of the Second Grade of Elementary School's Science and Experimental Book with Creativity Components and High Levels of Bloom's Cognitive Domain. *Journal of Innovation and Creativity in Human Science, 3*(3), 161-186.

Arasteh, H., Azizi Shamami, M., Jafarirad, A., & Mohammadi Jozani, Z. (2010). We are assessing the status of students' Moral Intelligence, *Journal of Culture Strategy Quarterly*, 11, 214-201.

Attaran, M. (2003). Comparison of two approaches in religious education with emphasis on the element of ethics, *Proceedings of the Conference on the Pathology of Religious Education in Education*.

Bahrami, M. A., Asmi, M., Fatahpanah, A., Dehghani Tafti, Arafa., & Ahmadi Tehrani, Gh. (2012). Level of Ethical Intelligence of Faculty Members and Experts of Shahid Sadoughi University of Medical Sciences, Yazd, *Journal of Medical Ethics and History*, 5 (6), 88-75.

Bakhtiari, N., & Soleimani, I. (2017). Comparison of Moral Intelligence and its Components in cheating and non-cheating students, Culture in Islamic University, 7 (2), 226-205.

Borba, M. (2005). *Building Moral Intelligence: The Seven Essential Virtues that Teach Kids to Do the Right Thing*. The University of Michigan.

Borba, M. (2011). *Cultivation of Moral Intelligence*. Translated by Firoozeh Kavousi. Tehran: Roshd Publications.

Delbari, S.H., Fallah, V., & Saffarian Hamedani, S. (2015) The effect of Components of Moral Intelligence based on the approach of Islamic education mediated by social capital on students' self-awareness, *Journal of Social Psychology*, 8 (56), 11 -1.

Ford, R. C., & Richardson, W. D. (1994). Ethical decision making: A review of the empirical literature [Book Review]. *Journal of Business Ethics,* 13 (3), 205 – 221.

Golmohammadian, M., Farhabaksh, K., & Ismail, M. (2012). Study the effectiveness of Moral, cultural, and spiritual Intelligence on marital satisfaction. *Journal of Family Counselling and Psychotherapy*.

Haghighat, Sh., & Mazidi, M. (2008) Study and evaluation of the philosophical background and educational methods of four approaches to contemporary Moral education, *Journal of Religious Thought*, Shiraz University, 8 (26), 134-105.

HajidehAbadi, M. (2000). Perspectives on the position and role of ethics in education, *Journal of Islamic Education (Book 2), Special Issue on Ethical Education*, Tehran: Publications of the Deputy Minister of Education.

Hardy, S.A. & G. Carlo (2005). "Moral Identities, Social Anxiety, and Academic Dishonesty among American College Students". *Journal Ethics & Behavior*, 17, 2007.

Hassanpour Rudbaraki, Z., & Mohammaddavoodi, A. H. (2015). The relationship between Moral Intelligence and knowledge sharing among high school teachers in Saveh, *Journal of Human Resources Studies*, 5 (20), 232-203.

Hawkins, K. A., & Trobst, K. K. (2000). Frontal lobe dysfunction and aggression: Conceptual issues and research findings. *Journal of Aggression and Violent Behavior*, 5(2), 147-157.

Hejazi, M., Entesar Foumani, G. H., & Hayatbakhsh, S. (2020). The effectiveness of Moral Intelligence training on academic ethics and academic self-efficacy of 10th Grade female students in public schools, *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 16 (56), 156-131.

Lennick D., & Kiel, F. (2008). *Moral Intelligence: enhancing business performance and leadership success*. Pennsylvania: what on School Publications.

Lennick, D., & Kiel, F. (2007). *Moral Intelligence: Enhancing business performance and leadership success. New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall*, 189- 568.

Lickona, T. (1993). The return of character education. *Journal of Educational Leadership*, 51(3), 6-11.

Mirsapasi, N. (1377). *Human resource management and labor relations*. Tehran: Mir Publications

Narvaez, D. (2013). The future of research in Moral development and education. *Journal of Moral Education*, 42(1), 1-11.

Nikogftar, M. (2007). The relationship between the hierarchy of values and public health. *Journal of Psychological Research*, 10 (19), 92-79.

Paksrasht, M. J. (2001). *Philosophical Schools and Educational Opinions*, Author: Gerald Gotek, Tehran: Samat Publications.

Rezapour Mirsaleh, Y., Kheradmand, T., & Shahedi, S. (2017). The effectiveness of Moral Intelligence training on social performance and behavioral problems, *Journal of Ethics in Science and Technology*, 12 (4), 62-51.

Romey, Wiliyam. (1968). *Inquiry techniques for teaching Science*. London: Prentice Hall.

Shannon, A., Bowena, Ch., Flora, H. B., Yi-Ru, R. Ch., & Claudia, A. (2016). "Ethics as a precursor to the organization–public relationships: Building trust before and during the OPR model". *Journal of Cogent Social Sciences*, 2(1), 23-37.

Shokohi, Gh. H. (1995). *Principles and principles of education, (ninth edition)*, Mashhad: Astan Quds Razavi Publications.

Tanner, C., & Christen, M. (2014). *Moral Intelligence–A framework for understanding Moral Competencies*. In Empirically Informed Ethics: Morality between Facts and Norms (pp. 119-136). Springer International Publishing.

Tom, AR. (1984). *Teaching as a Moral craft*. New York: Addison-Wesley Longman Ltd.